

Deleting the Fiction: Abandoned Horses

December 23, 2007

Information collected by
Terry Torrence, John Holland and Valerie James-Patton
Report Compiled by Valerie James-Patton

Forward

Note to all journalists and reporters:

Groups are now in place to verify all abandoned horse article claims made anywhere in the United States. Any articles or news stories which make claims about abandoned horses, will be checked for verification through police reports, state park services, and all other places that claims have been made about abandoned horses anywhere in the U.S., due to the findings that many reporters are writing false or unverified articles about abandoned horses.

The current findings of these articles will be presented in this report. These include opposing articles, police reports, letters to the writers of these stories, documentation written by Kentucky Representative, Ed Whitfield, Kentucky Governor Ernie Fletcher, as well as documentation from the sources of claims where these supposed horses have been abandoned.

So far, all the current abandoned horse articles have been found to be fabricated, as shown in the evidence presented here.

~~~~~

## **Fiction: Kentucky**

<http://www.sfgate.com/cgi-bin/article.cgi=/n/a/2007/03/14/national/a210114Do6.DTL>

**Kentucky Overrun with Unwanted Horses, by Jeffrey McMurray,  
Associated Press  
3-14-2007**

Excerpt claims from article regarding abandoned horses:

There have been reports of horses chained up in eastern Kentucky and left for days without food or water. Others have been turned loose in the countryside.

Some people who live near the strip mines in the mountains of impoverished eastern Kentucky say that while horses have long been left to roam free there, the number now may be in the thousands, and they are seeing herds three times bigger than they did just five years ago.

"There's horses over there that's lame, that's blind," said Doug Kidd, who owns 30 horses in Lackey, Ky. "They're taking them over there for a graveyard because they have nowhere to move them."

## **Fiction Deleted:**

See letter from Kentucky Governor Ernie Fletcher dated May 16<sup>th</sup>, 2007 below.



COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY  
OFFICE OF THE GOVERNOR

ERNIE FLETCHER  
GOVERNOR

May 16, 2007

700 CAPITAL AVENUE  
SUITE 100  
FRANKFORT, KY 40601  
(502) 564-2611  
FAX: (502) 564-2517

Ms. Lucille Matte  
2475 Underwood # 270  
Houston, TX 77030

Dear Ms. Matte:

Thank you for contacting me in regard to the article by Jeffrey McMurray that appeared in newspapers around the country.

The mail I have received on this issue is from out of state. Kentuckians know that Kentucky horse owners are very responsible people and the situation described in the article is not based in fact. The story as portrayed by Mr. McMurray is filled with inaccurate statements and information.

The Commonwealth has laws on the books to protect horses and other animals from inhumane treatment. Those who choose to abuse animals reflect poorly on their own humanity. I believe we have sufficient resources and organizations to handle any problems with unwanted horses in Kentucky.

I appreciate your concerns and this opportunity to clarify our position. Kentucky is known internationally for our love of horses and I regret that a story filled with inaccuracies has caused others to question that fact.

Please feel free to contact me any time an issue is important to you. Thank you for your willingness to become involved in resolving this matter.

Sincerely,

  
Ernie Fletcher

KentuckyUnbridledSpirit.com



An Equal Opportunity Employer M/F/D

## **Fiction Deleted:**

[http://www.jacksonville.com/tu-online/stories/032807/opl\\_8875357.shtml](http://www.jacksonville.com/tu-online/stories/032807/opl_8875357.shtml)

### **No abandoned horses found, by Ed Whitfield, U.S. Representative, Kentucky 3-28-07**

KENTUCKY

No abandoned horses found

The March 14 article titled "Kentucky, land of the thoroughbred, swamped with unwanted horses" could not have been further from the truth.

There is no crisis and there is no glut of "unwanted horses" roaming the Bluegrass State or anywhere else.

Though I knew the article was completely inaccurate, I did investigate.

When contacted for confirmation about this particular story, Lt. Phil Crumpton, Kentucky State Police media relations branch commander, said, "You must be joking?"

Upon realizing that it was a serious question, he confirmed that there had been no reports of unwanted horses to headquarters or any of the regional posts.

At the annual meeting of the Kentucky Animal Care and Control Association, the organization's president, Dan Evans, surveyed the membership about the situation.

None reported an increase in abandoned horses or sightings.

Beyond the inaccurate reporting, it is tragic that the pro-horse slaughter movement has managed to manipulate the mainstream media.

The three remaining Belgian-owned slaughterhouses in Texas and Illinois killed over 100,000 healthy, wanted horses last year to supply overseas' diners with an expensive delicacy.

While responsible horse owners may have legitimate reasons for giving up their horses, all agree slaughter should not be an option.

I encourage everyone to get the facts on horse slaughter and help support passage of the American Horse Slaughter Prevention Act currently before Congress.

ED WHITFIELD, U.S. representative, First District, Kentucky, Washington, D.C.

\*\*\*\*\*

## **Fiction: Ohio**

[http://www.zwire.com/site/news.cfm?newsid=18915960&BRD=1698&PAG=461&dept\\_id=21849&rfi=6](http://www.zwire.com/site/news.cfm?newsid=18915960&BRD=1698&PAG=461&dept_id=21849&rfi=6)

**'A question of horse cents', by Betsy Scott  
Ohio News Herald  
10-14-2007**

### Excerpt claims from the article regarding abandoned horses:

Imagine sitting down for a picnic lunch on the scenic Chardon Square and having a stray horse come cantering across your blanket. Such a sight might not be too far-fetched in the future, say some who are familiar with the state's horse scene.

Diane Jones of Windt im Wald farm in Auburn Township, who is on the state Farm Bureau Equine Advisory Committee, states:  
"The Ohio Horse Council president has reported horses being abandoned in state parks in southern Ohio."

~~~~~

Fiction Deleted:

From: "farms156" <farms156@...>
Subject: Re: abandoned horses in southern Ohio parks
Date: Tue, 16 Oct 2007 18:14:02 -0400

Ist I,d like to say I never talked to any reporters anywhere at any time. We have had talks about what is happening to horses among ourselves. What I,ve heard was that if you take a horse to sugarcreek ,you had better when you leave have a horse, or have a sales receipt. It was said people where taking horses and leaving them in pens. I was told that horses have been turned lose in the Perry Forest. With times as hard as they are for people who knows what to expect. I hope that people prove us wrong and don't just turn them loose.
Please fill free to contact me.
Rick Patterson

----- Original Message -----

From: Terry Torrance
To: farms156@...
Sent: Sunday, October 14, 2007 11:24 PM
Subject: abandoned horses in southern Ohio parks

Mr. Patterson,
In the News-Herald.com I read the article - A question of horse cents. In the article a Diane Jones of Windt im Wald farms in Auburn Township stated that the Ohio Horse Council president has reported horses being abandoned in state parks in southern Ohio. My question is what parks are these horses being abandoned in? What county are the parks in? And what legal authorities would I contact to inquire about these abandoned horses?
Thank You,
Terry Torrance

~~~~~  
~~~~~

From : Sanders, Chad <Chad.Sanders@...>
Sent : Friday, November 2, 2007 2:51 PM
To : <terrygean@...>
CC : "Shuman, Tom" <Tom.Shuman@...>
Subject : RE: horses turned lose in Perry Forest

Ms. Torrance
I spoke to our folks at Perry State Forest about your question, apparently you had called them as well.
We do not have any knowledge of horses being loosed at state forests. I haven't found anyone who knows anything about your question. Sorry for the delay in response.
I will continue to try to find any information on this from our other constituent groups.
Thank you for your note
Chad

Chad Sanders
Land Management Administrator
ODNR - Division of Forestry
2045 Morse Road, Building H-1
Columbus, OH 43229-6693
(O) 614-265-6701
(Fax) 614-447-9231
www.ohiodnr.com/forestry/

-----Original Message-----

From: Karas, Don On Behalf Of Forestry
Sent: Monday, October 22, 2007 4:47 PM
To: Sanders, Chad
Cc: Harkness, Sherry
Subject: FW: horses turned lose in Perry Forest

How shall I respond to this?

-----Original Message-----

From: Terry Torrance [mailto:terrygean@...]
Sent: Saturday, October 20, 2007 11:24 PM
To: Forestry
Subject: horses turned lose in Perry Forest

I read an article in the News-Herald that the President of the Ohio Horse Council has reported horses being abandoned in state parks in southern Ohio. When I contacted Mr. Rick Patterson of the Ohio Horse Council he informed me that he was told that horses are being turned lose in Perry Forest. So I am contacting you to see if this is true. And if so could you tell me how many reports of horses being turned lose in Perry Forest do you have? Have you had a horses being turned lose in any of the parks in Ohio? If so how many reports do you have and what parks or forests?

Thank You,
Terry Torrance

Fiction: Utah

<http://harpers.org/archive/2007/11/hbc-90001677>

Voting "Neigh" on the Horsemeat Ban, by Ken Silverstein November 16, 2007 Harper's Magazine

Excerpt claims from the article regarding abandoned horses:

Patricia Evans, of Utah State University's Animal, Dairy, and Veterinary Sciences Department, says that more horses are being abandoned now that domestic slaughterhouses have been closed. The advocates "predicted that shutting down domestic slaughterhouses wouldn't increase neglect and abuse, but we're in the real world," she said. "Unfortunately, kids get abused and so do animals." (Evans will be speaking about the issue tomorrow at 10 a.m. Mountain Time on KPCW, an NPR affiliate in Utah. A link should be available at the station's website.)

Fiction Deleted:

RE: abandoned horses
From: Terry Torrance (terrygean@...)
Sent: Thu 11/22/07 11:15 PM
To: Pat Evans (patevans@...)
Cc: sla@...

Ms. Evans,

I am confused about your email. I do not know what you mean by "due to the actions of some groups I am not going to give out the names of those contacted." I do not know what that has to do with me. I do not need any persons name. I just need the agencies that have told you about these abandoned horses. According to the Utah Livestock Laws Chapter 25 Estrays & Trespassing animals there must have been police reports made when these abandoned horses were found. I would only need the city, county and states. The police departments. I am sure that that is all public information. How am I to believe the statements of abandoned horses if I cannot document them? As a College Professor I am sure that you advise your students to check the facts before making a conclusion on an issue. Did your school do a research project on the abandoned horse issue?

Thank You,
Terry Torrance

Subject: RE: abandoned horses
Date: Mon, 19 Nov 2007 07:14:00 -0700
From: patevans@...
To: terrygean@...

Terry, thanks for the email. I have decided since speaking on the radio that due to the actions of some groups I am not going to give out the names of those contacted. We were able to find this information and I am sure you can as well as you search deeper. Good luck in your search. Dr. Evans

Patricia A. Evans, EdD
Extension Equine Specialist
Animal, Dairy and Veterinary Sciences Dept
4815 Old Main Hill
Logan, Utah 84322-4815
435 797 2142
patevans@...
<http://extension.usu.edu/equine/>

From: Terry Torrance [mailto:terrygean@...]
Sent: Saturday, November 17, 2007 7:09 AM
To: Pat Evans
Subject: abandoned horses

Ms. Evans,
In an article printed in HARPER'S Magazine you made the statement that more horses are being abandoned now that domestic slaughter houses have been closed. May I ask how you got that information? I am researching those claims. So I need the exact places of these abandonments, the names of the parks, auctions, Etc. What counties and states.

I will be looking forward to your information in help with my findings on the issue of abandoned horses.

Thank You
Terry Torrance

~~~~~  
~~~~~

RE: p
From: DWRCOMMENT DWRCOMMENT (dwrcomment@utah.gov)
Sent: Mon 11/26/07 5:11 PM
To: Terry Torrance (terrygean@...)

Terry,
We do not have any reports of horses being abandoned on our Wildlife Management Areas. For information on State Parks you will need to contact Utah State parks at parkcomment@utah.gov. As for Forest areas or BLM land you will want to contact the U.S. Forest Service or the BLM.

Thank you for contacting us!

State of Utah Department of Natural
ResourcesWildlife Division
1594 W North Temple
Salt Lake City, UT
84116801.538.4700dwrcomment@utah.gov

Recorded Information 1-877-592-5169 (toll free)

[http://www.wildlife .utah.gov](http://www.wildlife.utah.gov) >>>

Terry Torrance <terrygean@...> 11/26/2007 10:11 AM

I am not inquiring about wild horses. I am inquiring about domestic abandoned horses. Domestic abandoned horses in your park and/or forests. Are you telling me that you have no record of domestic abandoned horses being let loose in your parks/forests?

Terry Torrance

Date: Mon, 26 Nov 2007 09:18:17 -0700

From: dwrcomment@utah.gov

To: terrygean@

Subject: Re:

Terry,

The Division of Wildlife resources does not have the information you are looking for. The Bureau of Land Management are the one's in charge of wild horses. They may have that information for you. They can be reached at 1-801-539-4001.

Thank you for contacting us!
State of Utah Department of Natural Resources
Wildlife Division
1594 W North Temple
Salt Lake City, UT
84116 > 801.538.4700 > dwrcomment@utah.gov >

Recorded Information 1-877-592-5169 (toll free)

[http://www.wildlife .utah.gov](http://www.wildlife.utah.gov)

Terry Torrance <terrygean@...>

11/25/2007 6:52 PM

I am contacting you because I have heard that there are horses being turned loose (abandoned) in your Parks and Forests. Could you tell me how many reports you have of abandoned horses? Could you tell me what Parks or Forests? And could you tell where I could get copies of the reports of abandoned horses? I am looking for the documentation of the reports. And what happened to the abandoned horses after the authorities were notified?

Thank You.
Terry Torrance

~~~~~  
~~~~~

Fiction: Oregon

<http://www.oregonlive.com/news/oregonian/index.ssf?/base/news/1195178173302820.xml&coll=7&thispage=1>

**They abandon horses, don't they?, by Richard Cockle,
The Oregonian Staff
The Oregonian
November 18, 2007**

Excerpt claims from the article regarding abandoned horses:

LA GRANDE -- Ranchers in the old West sometimes contended with horse thieves, but in the modern West the opposite is occurring -- more and more people are abandoning unwanted domestic horses on ranches and public lands.

The high price of hay -- now bringing upward of \$160 per ton in some areas -- and the closure this fall of the nation's last domestic horsemeat processing facility in Illinois may be partly to blame.

At least nine horses have been turned loose on Wannie MacKenzie's ranch north of Jordan Valley in the past 18 to 24 months. And the Malheur County cattleman is bracing for the appearance of more old and hungry horses as cash-strapped owners in Idaho's Treasure Valley run out of winter hay.

Unwanted horses also are being released at livestock sale yards, including the Intermountain Livestock Market near La Grande, where one turned up last month, and on U.S. Bureau of Land Management land.

"We are hearing stories from all over of people abandoning horses" at livestock sale yards, said Gary Conway, spokesman for the Texas-based American Quarter Horse Association.

In remote areas, horse owners sometimes forgo paying to have a vet euthanize a horse in lieu of just shooting it. MacKenzie said he can't bring himself to shoot horses abandoned on his ranch.

Fiction Deleted:

Richard Cockle <rcockle@oregonwireless.net> wrote:
Date: Wed, 28 Nov 2007 07:57:14 -0800
From: Richard Cockle <rcockle@oregonwireless.net>
To: Valerie James-Patton <valerie_jamespatton@.....>
Subject: Re: Misleading article: "They abandon horses, don't they?"

Like I say, lady. I stand behind every word in my story. So bring it on.

Valerie James-Patton wrote:

Mr. Cockle,
The "merely 9 horses" was not from my statement. That was your statement made in the article.
I will repeat again what the Under sheriff told to me this morning. He did not investigate the case of the 9 horses, and he could not remember investigating any abandoned horse cases himself. He stated that there might have possibly been 2 recent cases, although they were not investigated by his department, but he wasn't sure. He did say that BLM had stated they had a few recent cases of abandoned horses and that they were to have a meeting with BLM regarding the matter. It's funny how the story is now changing. I don't believe I will be the one humiliated by this, and I don't believe that my asking questions to verify the article you wrote is insane. I do believe however, that you will be hearing much more regarding your article. I can guarantee you that.
Have a nice evening, sir.
Valerie James-Patton

/Richard Cockle / wrote:

Ms James-Patton

Kindly call the under sheriff back. He investigated the appearance of roughly 20 unwanted and abandoned horses in recent months, some on BLM lands. Not merely 9 horses as you said. The 9 were on a rancher's land.

To repeat, he investigated 20 abandoned horses. I have no idea what Wolfe told you, or what you think you heard him say, or what you may even be hallucinating. But we appear to be having a disconnect here. I stand by my story, and I certainly will not retract it.

Wolfe told me, "I think it's going to get to be a lot bigger problem than it is now. I'm almost sure of it."

Read the above sentence again, slowly, please. It's a problem in his opinion, that probably will get bigger.

Now, lady, come clean with me. What is your problem? It certainly isn't an absolutely accurate account of an interview with an under sheriff in Back of Beyond, Oregon. I realize abandoned horses makes for an emotional issue. But this kind of insane reaction to a newspaper story can only humiliate you later. This computer has a delete button, and if you persist in harping on this same nonsense, I will use it on your next e-mail. Merry Christmas.

Valerie James-Patton wrote:

Dear Mr. Cockle,

The story stating that 9 horses were abandoned in Malheur county and were investigated by the Undersheriff Brian Wolfe is very misleading.

The Undersheriff knew nothing of the 9 horses you claimed he investigated. He said he had heard that there might possibly have been 2 cases of abandoned horses in a nearby county, but he wasn't sure. He said that those horses were not investigated by his department.

Your article clearly misleads the public into thinking that the Undersheriff investigated 9 abandoned horse cases, which were in Malheur county, when in fact, he did not. Your article also states that the Undersheriff said he tries to find home for the abandoned horses and 90% of those horses are not branded. When I asked him about this, he said that it was true that 90% of the animals abandoned that he investigates, is not exclusively horses,

but also includes dogs and cats. It's obvious that dogs and cats are not "branded". However, he couldn't even remember a case of abandoned horses that he has investigated.

Based on this, I do not believe an apology is due to you, and I am still requesting that you retract your misleading statements, with an apology to the public. Your article has appeared nationwide, and is alarming to horse owners everywhere.

Valerie James-Patton

/Richard Cockle / wrote:

The information regarding abandoned horses was obtained from the rancher named in the article and the under sheriff. Nothing was fabricated, and suggesting otherwise is downright silly. Given the goodwill of the holiday season and the fact that this letter undoubtedly is just the sort of fanciful thing you often dash off on a winter's morning, I propose to forgive you. I've also forgiven the Grinch. You might, however, feel better if you'd e-mail me back promptly (Promptly, mind you! No shilly-shallying!) with an apology. I choose to believe you are actually a very nice person and are deeply ashamed of yourself. Merry Christmas. Richard Cockle.

Valerie James-Patton wrote:
November 27, 2007

Richard Cockle
The Oregonian

Valerie James-Patton
Shingletown, CA

Dear Mr. Cockle,
After reading your article "They abandon horses, don't they?" in the Oregonian, and seeing it appear in several other publications nationwide, I called Undersheriff Brian Wolfe this morning, and asked him about the article. He stated he had not read the article, and wasn't sure what it contained, so I quoted statements in your article to him about the 9 abandoned horses in Malheur County. He said he had no control over what was written, and he didn't know about the 9 horses in the article. He said he thought there might have been 2 recent cases of abandoned horses, although he didn't think they had been investigated by his department, and he wasn't sure. I asked him about the statement in your article where it says that "he tries to locate the owners tries to identify owners and charge them with animal abandonment or animal abuse but 90 percent of the horses are not branded."

He said that it's true, that 90% of the animals are not branded, but he also said that included dogs and cats, which are not branded. I asked him if he specifically had investigated any of the abandoned horses mentioned in your article, and he was clearly not even aware of those horses.

Journalism should be written to tell the truth to the public, and your article is very obviously fabricated and misleading to the public on the matter of abandoned horses in Malheur County, and I am sending this to your editor, as well as to you.

I believe you should write a retraction to this article, as it is causing alarm to horse owners nationwide.

I am pasting the article below as well to refresh your memory.

I will look forward to your reply on this.

Thank you-

Valerie James-Patton

~~~~~

Thu, 29 Nov 2007 08:38:47 -0800 (PST)

From: "Valerie James-Patton" <valerie\_jamespatton@.....>

Subject: RE: Abandoned Horses Found in Malheur County

To: "Brian Wolfe" <bwolfe@malheurco.org>

Dear Mr. Wolfe,

Thank you so much for sending this to me. I appreciate it very much.

I wrote to the writer of the article, and he basically got very angry and said I was insane for asking to verify the story. I was very surprised at how unprofessional and nasty he was.

Again, thank you so much.

Valerie

Brian Wolfe <bwolfe@malheurco.org> wrote:

Here are the requested information on abandoned horses. We have had three reports since June 2005.

Undersheriff Brian Wolfe

-----Original Message-----

From: Valerie James-Patton [mailto:valerie\_jamespatton@.....]

Sent: Tuesday, November 27, 2007 9:41 AM

To: bwolfe@malheurco.org

Subject: Abandoned Horses Found in Malheur County

Dear Undersheriff Wolfe,

I sent this letter to you last week, and I have tried to call your office. I will call again shortly. I am requesting a reply to my letter.

Thank you-

Valerie James-Patton

Valerie James-Patton <valerie\_jamespatton@.....> wrote:  
Date: Wed, 21 Nov 2007 10:09:57 -0800 (PST)  
From: Valerie James-Patton <valerie\_jamespatton@.....>  
Subject: Abandoned Horses Found in Malheur County  
To: bwolfe@malheurco.org

November 21, 2007

Malheur County  
Undersheriff Brian Wolfe

Valerie James-Patton

Dear Undersheriff Wolfe,

I read an article by Richard Cockle in the Oregonian yesterday stating that cattle rancher Wannie MacKenzie claims at least 9 horses have been turned loose on his ranch within the last 18 - 24 months. The article also states that you try to identify the owners of these animals to charge them with abandonment or animal abuse. Did you investigate any or all of these 9 incidences, and if so were any of the owners of these horses ever found, and were charges filed against any of those owners?

If no owners were located, can you please tell me what the outcome was for these abandoned horses? Surely they were not just left to run homeless on Mr. MacKenzie's property, so were they taken into custody by local shelters or any humane rescues? If so, I'd like to know the name of any of the shelters who might have taken any of these horses in.

You further stated in the article that 90 percent of the abandoned horses are not branded. What is the actual number that the 90% figure is derived from for abandoned horses, and what time frame does that number cover?

Have you been able to locate the owners of the other 10% of branded horses, and were charges filed? If so, what charges were filed and were the owners found to be guilty or were they found innocent?

From reading the article on abandoned horses, I'm wondering why there is such a high number of horses being turned loose in Malheur County, as I have never heard of so many horses being turned loose in the past or even any where else currently. I have friends who own horses close to Malheur, and hay is a little more expensive than last year, but not so expensive that people would just turn horses loose over a few extra dollars, and I know hay is more abundant all over the state of Oregon, than it is in many other states.

I realize there are cases of abandonment every now and then somewhere in the U.S., but other states are having a much harder time getting hay than people in Oregon are, and I'd like to understand the reason there is so much abandonment of horses in your county.



So please tell me how many abandoned horses were found in 2006, and how many have been found so far for this year? And please send me any documentation on these cases that you have available. I will look forward to your reply.

Thank you-  
Valerie James-Patton

11/27/2007 13:11:36 LE004  
WOLFE, BRIAN E  
PAGE 1

MALHEUR COUNTY SHERIFF OFFICE

Incident #: 01-2007-05662  
CAD: 34346  
Status/Dispo: ASSIGNED

**INCIDENT DETAIL**

Initial NOC: ANIMAL ABANDONMENT  
Ver NOC: ANIMAL ABANDONMENT  
Location: SUCCOR CREEK RD ADRIAN  
Cross St:  
District: 15  
Rpted to: HESSE, THEODORE  
Dispatch: HESSE, THEODORE

Reported Date/Time: 09/24/2007 12:11  
Occurred Date: 9/24/2007 TO 9/24/2007  
Occurred Time: 12:11:47PM TO 12:11:47PM

Reported By: OREGON STATE POLICE-MEDFORD  
2700 NORTH PACIFIC HWY.  
MEDFORD OR  
Phone 1: (541) 776-6111  
Phone 2:

**Incident Officers**

026893 HARRIMAN, RICHARD

**Incident Names**

| Name                        | Type           | Age |
|-----------------------------|----------------|-----|
| MCKENZIE, ADIAN             | REPORTED PARTY | 00  |
| OREGON STATE POLICE-MEDFORD | REPORTED PARTY |     |

**Description**

RP SAID GRANDAUGHTER SAW HORSE THAT THINK WAS DUMPED OFF ALONG SUCCOR CREEK RD ABOUT FIVE OR SIX MILES SOUTH OF HWY 201-ABOUT 1/2 MILE BEFORE SPRINGS BEEF MASTER RANCH-ONLY DESCRIPTION IS SKINNY HORSE OFF TO LEFT OF ROAD-  
09/25/07 S14 LOOKED FOR THE HORSE ALONG SUCCOR CREEK ROAD, IN THE AREA DESCRIBED. S14 MADE SEVERAL PASSES AND FINALLY WENT TO THE TOP OF THE HILL TO THE SOUTH OF THE ROAD. DOWN IN THE VALLEY TO THE SOUTH OF SUCCOR CREEK ROAD WERE SEVERAL HORSES AND COWS.  
UTL SICKLY HORSE. EITHER THIS WAS A STRAY OR THE HORSE FOUND IT'S WAY TO THE WATER WHERE THE REST OF THE HORSES ARE. UNFOUNDED FOR NOW.  
WE DIDNT HAVE A RETURN PHONE NUMBER SO THE COMPLAINANT WAS NOT CALLED BACK.  
S14

**CAD Remarks**

**Activity Log**

| Date       | Time  | Officer                  | Activity | Comments |
|------------|-------|--------------------------|----------|----------|
| 09/24/2007 | 13:34 | 026893 HARRIMAN, RICHARD | ADVISED  |          |

**Accident Report**

**Incident Citations**

**Incident Arrests**

**Incident Property**

**Incident Vehicles**

\*\*\*\*\*END OF REPORT\*\*\*\*\*

11/27/2007 13:11:36 LE004  
WOLFE, BRIAN E  
PAGE 1

MALHEUR COUNTY SHERIFF OFFICE

Incident #: 01-2007-05662  
CAD: 34346  
Status/Dispo: ASSIGNED

### INCIDENT DETAIL

**Initial NOC:** ANIMAL ABANDONMENT  
**Ver NOC:** ANIMAL ABANDONMENT  
**Location:** SUCCOR CREEK RD ADRIAN  
**Cross St:**  
**District:** 15  
**Rptd to:** HESSE, THEODORE  
**Dispatch:** HESSE, THEODORE

**Reported Date/Time:** 09/24/2007 12:11  
**Occurred Date:** 9/24/2007 TO 9/24/2007  
**Occurred Time:** 12:11:47PM TO 12:11:47PM  
**Reported By:** OREGON STATE POLICE-MEDFORD  
2700 NORTH PACIFIC HWY.  
MEDFORD OR  
**Phone 1:** (541) 776-6111  
**Phone 2:**

#### Incident Officers

026893 HARRIMAN, RICHARD

#### Incident Names

| <u>Name</u>                 | <u>Type</u>    | <u>Age</u> |
|-----------------------------|----------------|------------|
| MCKENZIE, ADIAN             | REPORTED PARTY | 00         |
| OREGON STATE POLICE-MEDFORD | REPORTED PARTY |            |

#### Description

RP SAID GRANDAUGHTER SAW HORSE THAT THINK WAS DUMPED OFF ALONG SUCCOR CREEK RD ABOUT FIVE OR SIX MILES SOUTH OF HWY 201-ABOUT 1/2 MILE BEFORE SPRINGS BEEF MASTER RANCH-ONLY DESCRIPTION IS SKINNY HORSE OFF TO LEFT OF ROAD-  
09/25/07 S14 LOOKED FOR THE HORSE ALONG SUCCOR CREEK ROAD, IN THE AREA DESCRIBED. S14 MADE SEVERAL PASSES AND FINALLY WENT TO THE TOP OF THE HILL TO THE SOUTH OF THE ROAD. DOWN IN THE VALLEY TO THE SOUTH OF SUCCOR CREEK ROAD WERE SEVERAL HORSES AND COWS.  
UTL SICKLY HORSE. EITHER THIS WAS A STRAY OR THE HORSE FOUND IT'S WAY TO THE WATER WHERE THE REST OF THE HORSES ARE. UNFOUNDED FOR NOW.  
WE DIDNT HAVE A RETURN PHONE NUMBER SO THE COMPLAINANT WAS NOT CALLED BACK.  
S14

#### CAD Remarks

#### Activity Log

| <u>Date</u> | <u>Time</u> | <u>Officer</u>           | <u>Activity</u> | <u>Comments</u> |
|-------------|-------------|--------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| 09/24/2007  | 13:34       | 026893 HARRIMAN, RICHARD | ADVISED         |                 |

#### Accident Report

#### Incident Citations

#### Incident Arrests

#### Incident Property

#### Incident Vehicles

\*\*\*\*\*END OF REPORT\*\*\*\*\*

**INCIDENT DETAIL**

Initial NOC: ANIMAL ABANDONMENT  
Ver NOC: ANIMAL ABANDONMENT  
Location: 740 SUCCOR CREEK RD ADRIAN MAP 24-4  
Cross St:  
District: 15  
Rpted to: ZIEGLER, CHERYL LEE  
Dispatch: ZIEGLER, CHERYL LEE

Reported Date/Time: 06/17/2005 14:49  
Occurred Date: 6/17/2005 TO 6/17/2005  
Occurred Time: 2:49:04PM TO 2:49:04PM  
Reported By: MARTINEZ, OSCAR G (SR DEP)  
MALHEUR COUNTY SHERIFF  
VALE OR 97918

Phone 1:  
Phone 2:

**Incident Officers**

022010 MARTINEZ, OSCAR

**Incident Names**

| <u>Name</u>                 | <u>Type</u>    | <u>Age</u> |
|-----------------------------|----------------|------------|
| HUMANE SOCIETY OF HARNEY CO | OTHER          |            |
| MARTINEZ, OSCAR G (SR DEP)  | REPORTED PARTY | 00         |
| MCCLASKEY, ZELLAH J         | SUSPECT        | 48         |
| SIEBOLZ, BRENT              | OTHER          | 00         |

**Description**

ADVISED THAT HE HAS A HORSE WITH A BROKEN REAR RIGHT LEG THAT HAS MENDED ON ITS OWN BUT IS DANGLING AND THE HORSE IS NOT USING IT. THERE IS 2 MEDIUM SIZE DOGS AND A CAT THAT HAVE NOT BEEN ATTENDED TO. DOGS APPEAR SEMI FRIENDLY, BUT THE CAT HAD TO BE DISPATCHED. THE ANIMALS SHOULD BE OKAY FOR A DAY OR TWO, BUT NEED ATTENDED TO. HARNEY COUNTY HUMANE SOCIETY WAS CONTACTED AND WILL COME AND CHECK ON THE HORSE AND DOGS.

**CAD Remarks**

**Activity Log**

| <u>Date</u> | <u>Time</u> | <u>Officer</u>         | <u>Activity</u> | <u>Comments</u>                                  |
|-------------|-------------|------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| 06/17/2005  | 14:49       | 022010 MARTINEZ, OSCAR | DISPATCHED      |                                                  |
| 06/17/2005  | 14:49       | 022010 MARTINEZ, OSCAR | ENROUTE         |                                                  |
| 06/17/2005  | 14:49       | 022010 MARTINEZ, OSCAR | ON SCENE        | LOCATION- 740 SUCCOR CREEK RD<br>ADRIAN MAP 24-4 |
| 06/17/2005  | 14:49       | 022010 MARTINEZ, OSCAR | IN SERVICE      |                                                  |

**Accident Report**

**Incident Citations**

**Incident Arrests**

**Incident Property**

**Incident Vehicles**

\*\*\*\*\*END OF REPORT\*\*\*\*\*

## **Fiction:**

<http://thomas.loc.gov/cgi-bin/query/D?r110:5:./temp/~r110VJFyFh::>

**Congressional Record article 5 of 176**

*Printer Friendly Display* - 2,047 bytes. [[Help](#)]

### **NOTICE OF INTENT TO OBJECT TO PROCEEDING -- (Senate - December 05, 2007)**

[Page: S14802] [GPO'S PDF](#)

---

Mr. CRAIG . Mr. President, I wish to notify the Senate of my intent to object to proceeding to S. 311, a bill to

[Page: S14803] [GPO'S PDF](#)

amend the Horse Protection Act to prohibit the shipping, transporting, moving, delivering, receiving, possessing, purchasing, selling, or donation of horses and other equines to be slaughtered for human consumption, and for other purposes.

The bill would prohibit the shipping, transporting, moving, delivering, receiving, possessing, purchasing, selling, or donation of horses and other equines to be slaughtered for human consumption. In short, it would further limit the already limited options for disposal of unwanted horses .

An unwanted horse is one that has reached the useful end of its economic or recreational life. There are numerous reasons for the existence of unwanted horses , not the least of which are economic reasons such as loss of job, price of feed or stabling, relocation, poor health of the horse or its owner.

It must be recognized that no one has adequately addressed the fate of the estimated 90,000 unwanted horses that were formerly slaughtered on an annual basis. Animal welfare groups and rescue organizations can only do so much to shoulder the load of aiding the adoption or care of these horses . They are currently stretched to capacity, and we expect an increase in need. **As a result, we are witnessing a significant increase in abandonment and neglect of horses in this country. Particularly in the West, growing numbers of unwanted horses are being dumped on public or private rangelands.**

I believe that we should take the time to examine this growing issue of the unwanted horse before passing legislation that ties the hands of horse owners, public and private land managers, and others.

## **Fiction Deleted:**

The 'fiction deleted' rests in all the evidence presented above.

However, it should be noted that Senator Craig has effectively blocked a bill, The American Horse Slaughter Prevention Act, from the Senate floor, denying the bill's chance to be heard and voted on, because of his mistaken belief that there is a significant increase in the abandonment of horses.

It's a shame that a U.S. Senator can be so easily duped and misled by reading a few fictitious and fabricated news articles. Instead of taking the time to learn the truth, he has ultimately blocked legislation that would have prevented thousands upon thousands of American horses from suffering horrible transport conditions as they are exported over our borders to foreign slaughterhouses, where they are cruelly and inhumanely butchered for their meat.

Senator Craig has acted out in ignorance of the truth and has succeeded in extending an execution order for the continuing slaughter of Americas horses, and whether or not we blame Senator Craig for his ignorance, we should surely hold all the journalists and reporters who wrote these fictitious and fabricated articles accountable for their dishonesty in journalism.

Will it matter to any of these 'reporters' that innocent horses will pay for those articles with their lives, terrified and screaming as they die, all because these writers 'sensationalized' their articles with fabricated stories, or will they just care about their next 'story'?

One reporter when confronted with the truth, Richard Cockle of the Oregonian, even went so far as to expand his fabricated story in anger, declaring it was an "insane reaction" for someone to question and try to verify the stories in his article. There was surely an insane reaction: it was his.

With the kind of reporting he does, how long will it be before we read he's been attacked by a whole herd of abandoned horses on his front lawn? But even if it turned out to be a litter of kittens exploring the neighborhood yards, it would not be surprising that he would still stick to his story. Maybe in his world, a horse and a kitten are the same, whether they're branded or not. They both have four feet, right? Just don't ask him any further questions. And don't expect him to care that he helped Senator Craig with the decision that will keep American horses going over the borders to slaughter. That might have been his intention anyway.

Since Cockle obviously is not concerned about reporting facts or the truth, what is his concern? The horse slaughter industry? Even if Cockle turned out to be a plant, paid off by the lobbying firm for the horse slaughter industry, which has happened before, I doubt we'll ever know for sure about Cockle. Even if he ever told the truth about his intentions, he couldn't be believed either way.

Too bad Senator Craig was too ignorant to realize that.

## **Conclusion:**

While many of us have read far too many letters from members of Congress, repeatedly degrading and insulting American horse owners everywhere, by making unfounded predictions about horse owners abandoning their horses, the letter from Kentucky Governor Ernie Fletcher truly deserves praise. Since abandoning a horse is a criminal act, it's highly insulting that so many of our Congress members believe American horse owners to be, more or less, common criminals, just waiting for a chance to dump and abandon their horses.

Governor Fletcher speaks out to defend Kentucky horse owners as being very responsible people, and assures the rest of the world, that Kentucky is capable of taking care of any unwanted horse problems. His pride for the citizens of Kentucky is clearly evident and admirable, yet it vividly magnifies the opposing comments often made by certain Congress members, in which they assure us that they suspect we will all soon be abandoning our horses, as though the American horse-owning public has no honor or integrity.

We need only to look at Senator Craig to understand how they've come to believe all their misinformation, obviously comfortable with their beliefs without attempting or bothering to learn the facts behind the fiction. It's scary knowing they hold positions in government and have a hand in running this country. Is it any wonder why the American public has lost its trust and faith in this administration?

In conclusion, one article stands out, deleting the fiction written by these so-called journalists by using the evidence discovered in our search for the truth, and which we've presented here. It was originally published in the printed newspaper version of Florida's Ocala Star Banner. It has been republished in "Tuesday's Horse". It is written by John Holland, and entitled "Run For your lives".

<http://tuesdayshorse.wordpress.com/2007/12/18/run-for-your-lives/>

### **Run for your lives**

Dec 18, 2007

By JOHN HOLLAND

Bring in your children and potted plants and barricade your door...they're coming! No, it is not Al Qaeda or even the Iranian Revolutionary Guard. The abandoned horses are coming and the destruction will be biblical!

At least that is the message of sensationalized articles appearing all over the country. They warn that horses are being abandoned because of the closing of U.S. horse slaughter plants, and because of the severe hay shortage in much of the Southeast.

An AP article by Richard Cockle of the Oregonian carries the headline Abandoned horses pose dilemma for ranchers, while another AP story quotes the executive director of the North Carolina Horse Council as saying an estimated 120,000 horses have been abandoned already. A month earlier, Dave Russell in the Yankton Press and Dakotan put the estimate of unwanted horses at “212,000 and counting!” And an official from the American Horse Council was quoted in a Dallas paper as saying owners would soon be abandoning 312,000 unwanted starving horses because of the recent closing of three U.S. horse slaughter facilities.

Betsy Scott of the Northern Ohio News Herald even offered up an image of horses ruining our next outing by cantering across our picnic blankets! As proof, Scott quoted a horsewoman as saying that the President of the Ohio Horse Council had reported horses being abandoned in the state’s parks.

But before you head for the basement with an armload of groceries, you should know that this is, in the immortal words of Yogi Berra, “deja vous all over again.” In 1998, California banned horse slaughter and almost immediately a series of stories popped up about horses being abandoned in the desert, just as the slaughter proponents had warned would happen. Unfortunately nobody could find the horses.

In February, the two Texas horse slaughter plants closed after a long court battle with the state over a 1949 law prohibiting the sale of horse meat. Within weeks AP college basketball stringer Jeffrey McMurray did a shocking investigative report that was published around the world with titles such as Kentucky, land of the thoroughbred, swamped with unwanted horses!

The McMurray article was based on horses seen free grazing at a reclaimed strip mine in Eastern Kentucky. The only problem was that the horses were all privately owned and had not been abandoned. The Kentucky State Police and animal control officials immediately debunked the McMurray story but it raised such a furor that Kentucky Governor Ernie Fletcher responded with a letter saying it was “filled with inaccurate statements and information.”

Undeterred by these denials, the American Veterinary Medical Association (AVMA), a leading horse slaughter proponent, sent the McMurray article to its member veterinarians as proof that they had been right all along about the dire effects of a ban on horse slaughter.

So were these stories more of the same? After extensive research, our findings indicate that confirmed cases of abandoned horses rank somewhere between the number of sightings of the Lock Ness monster and those of Big Foot, but without the solid photographic evidence.



Starting with the story about the horses becoming such a “dilemma” for Oregon’s ranchers one has only to read beyond the sensationalized headline to see it was based on a staggering nine (9) horses that had shown up at a ranch in Oregon. More tellingly they had shown up over a 24 month period, putting their appearance at the ranch before the U.S. slaughter plants were even closed.

But the Oregonian story has worse problems. Horse abandonment is a crime, and Cockle quoted Malheur County Undersheriff Brian Wolfe as saying he tried to determine the owners of such animals but that they were rarely branded. This implied that Wolfe had investigated the incident. When contacted, Wolfe said he knew nothing of the situation. Official reports showed only three cases involving horses since 2005; a case of an injured horse found on an abandoned property with other animals, a case of a horse carcass dropped at a gravel pit and a report of an abandoned horse which was determined to be unfounded.

So our investigation turned to those picnic wrecking horses being turned loose in the Ohio parks. The President of the Ohio Horse Council responded to our enquires saying that he never made the statement on the record but that he had “heard” that horses had been turned loose in the Perry Forest. Perry Forest officials said that no horses had been abandoned there.

Next we checked with every agency in North Carolina that governs forest or park lands and found no record of abandoned horses. So we contacted the North Carolina Horse Council about their claim. They were helpful but could only recall that the number (actually 90,000) had come from the American Horse Council, possibly as an email that “probably no longer existed.”

By this point we had estimates ranging from 90,000 to 320,000 abandoned horses and most seemed to be attributed to the American Horse Council. I contacted Sara Chase, the AHC Director of Communications to ask how the estimate/s were made and which estimate was correct. Ms. Chase stated for the record that neither the AHC nor their Unwanted Horse Coalition had ever put out a number, and that none of those quotes should have ever been made!

Meanwhile, Harper’s Magazine quoted Pat Evans of Utah State University Veterinary Sciences Department as saying that more horses are being abandoned now that the slaughter houses were closed. But when asked for her sources Dr. Evans declined to disclose them. So we contacted every appropriate state agency in Utah. We found no documented cases of abandoned horses there either.

Unfortunately, the impression that all these baseless stories and their tabloid style headlines convey persists long after they are disproved. If you can produce enough smoke people will believe there has to be a fire, and as Joseph Goebbels observed, people will believe a big lie sooner than a small one.

Ironically, even if these stories were true they would tell us nothing about the impact of closing the horse slaughter outlet because it has not been closed. American horses are merely going over the borders to slaughter in Mexico and Canada in nearly the same numbers (down just 17%) as before the closings.

The question is what is likely to happen when Congress passes HR.503 / S.311 and really ends the slaughter of our horses? To predict that future we have only to look at the past, and it is this historical record that has the pro-slaughter forces pumping out smoke screens because it directly contradicts their fear mongering.

For example, in 1989 the USDA reported 379,571 American horses were slaughtered or exported for slaughter. By 2002 that number had plunged to just 77,713 as a result of reduced demand for their meat. There was no government sponsored rescue effort and no documented increase in either neglect or abandonment.

Likewise, when the Cavel horse slaughter plant in Illinois burned on Easter Sunday in 2002, it took about 40% of U.S. horse slaughter capacity off line for over two years. Yet, the year after the fire the number of cases of abuse and neglect reported by the Illinois Department of Agriculture (which had doubled in the three years before the fire) actually went down.

None of this is to say we are not facing a hard winter, but horse owners have seen worse. “Last year in Texas we had a horrible hay shortage when stocks were depleted by the commercial suppliers,” said Steven Long, author, and Vice President of the Greater Houston Horse Council. “Not only did we suffer a hay shortage, we had a frightening water shortage when the stock tanks dried up. Yet I don’t know of a single case of an abandoned horse.”

###

*John Holland is a freelance writer and the author of three books. He frequently writes on the subject of horse slaughter from his small farm in the mountains of Virginia, where he lives with his wife, Sheilah, and their 10 horses.*